

Contents

Foreword by Aziz Tuffi Saliba	iii
Foreword by Daniele Amoroso	v
Preface	ix
List of Abbreviations	xi
Introduction	1

Part I: Setting the Ground for Discussing State Responsibility in the Context of Autonomous Weapons Systems

1. Autonomous Weapons Systems: Concepts and Unpredictability	13
1.1 A Definition of Autonomous Weapons Systems (AWS)	13
1.1.1 Is it Necessary to Define AWS?	14
1.1.2 The Decision-Making Process and the Human Role: A Background to Definitions	15
1.1.3 AWS: A Spectrum of Definitions	16
1.1.4 A Working Definition of AWS for the Present Research	21
1.2 The Inherent Unpredictability of AWS	24
1.2.1 Autonomous Devices' Inherent Unpredictability (Genus)	25
1.2.2 AWS Inherent Unpredictability (Species)	26
1.2.3 Systemic Complexities: the Black Box Dilemma	28
1.2.4 Unpredictability Due to Interaction with the Environment	30
2. The Accountability Gap, the Focus on Individual Criminal Responsibility, and the Shadow of State Responsibility until 2022	32
2.1 AWS and the Individual Accountability Gap	33
2.2 The Lack of Focus on State Responsibility	38
2.2.1 The Ghost of State Responsibility at the CCW GGE	40
2.2.2 The 2022 Shift in the GGE as Regards State Responsibility	43

Part II: International Responsibility of States and Autonomous Weapons Systems: Articles on the Responsibility of States For Internationally Wrongful Acts

3. The Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts and Autonomous Weapon Systems	47
3.1 AWS and State Responsibility	49
3.2 The 2022 Shift in the Debate at the CCW GGE on LAWS	51
4. The Internationally Wrongful Act of a State: General Principles, Attribution, and Breach of an International Obligation	52
4.1 Attribution of Conduct to a State: Do AWS Call for Special Rules?	52
4.1.1 The ARSIWA and Attribution of the Conduct of AWS to the State	54
4.1.2 Doctrine on the ARSIWA and the Human Action Paradigm	56
4.2 The Breach of an International Obligation	66
4.3 AWS and Damage	67
4.4 AWS and Challenges to State the Time of an Internationally Wrongful Act	69
5. The Internationally Wrongful Act of a State: Responsibility of a State for AWS Violations in Connection with the Act of Another State	72
5.1 Obligation not to Aid Assistance to another State: the Problem of Intent	73
5.2 AWS Placed at the Disposal of a State by Another State: AWS Designed, Manufactured, and Programmed by one State and Deployed by Another	75
5.3 Swarms Composed of AWS of Different States	77
6. The Internationally Wrongful Act of a State: Force Majeure; and the Content of the International Responsibility of a State: Assurances of Non-Repetition	80
6.1 The Danger of Excluding Responsibility Based on Force Majeure	80
6.2 Assurance of Non-Repetition	83
7. Autonomous Weapons Systems and Special Issues Related to Primary Norms Impacting Responsibility	86
7.1 Human-Machine Interaction and State Responsibility	86
7.1.1 CCW GGE's Principles Related to Human-Machine Interaction	86

7.1.2	Meaningful Human Control Discussions at CCW GGE	87
7.1.3	Meaningful Human Control, Appropriate Levels of Human Judgment, and State Responsibility: An Analysis of Prospective Paths	91
7.1.4	Is there an International Obligation for States to Ensure a Degree of Human Involvement?	93
7.2	Responsibility for not Using AWS	95
7.2.1	The Consequentialist Perspective	95
7.2.2	State Statements at CCW that Lean towards a Consequentialist Perspective	97
7.2.3	Precision in the Attack: An Obligation to Use the More Precise Weapon?	99
7.2.4	Back to the Question: Responsibility for not Using AWS	101
7.3	Weapons Review and State Responsibility	102
7.3.1	Weapon Review: GGE's Guiding Principles and States' Perspectives	104
7.3.2	Back to the Question: Weapon Review and AWS	109
7.4	State Responsibility Due to Breach of the Due Diligence Obligation	111
7.4.1	State Breach of Due Diligence as Regards its Own Activities, State-Sponsored Activities, and Private Actors' Activities	114
7.4.2	Back to the Question: States due Diligence Obligation and AWS	118

Part III: Mind the Gaps: Venues to Enhance State Responsibility and Accountability

8.	Autonomous Weapons Systems: Regulative Options and Substantive Possibilities <i>De Lege Ferenda</i>	125
8.1	Regulative Options: Overview	126
8.1.1	States' Positions	126
8.1.2	Reflection on the Regulative Options	128
8.2	Substance: Scholarship Frameworks	130
8.2.1	Analogical Interpretation	130
8.2.2	Evolutionary Interpretation	134
8.2.3	Tort Law Approach	135
8.2.4	Administrative Law Approach	136
8.3	A Specific Regime of AWS Bears the Risk of Fragmentation of IHL?	137
8.4	The Need for Adequate Paths to Address State Responsibility Challenges in Regarding AWS	139

9. Issues that can be Addressed Through Tailored Attribution Rules	140
9.1 A Broader Attribution Rule	140
9.2 Predefined Schemes of Attribution	145
10. Issues that can be Addressed Through a Strict Liability Regime	147
10.1 Strict Liability	147
10.1.1 Tailored Strict Liability Responsibility Regimes	150
10.2 Strict Liability for AWS as a Primary Rule: Addressing the Intent and Breach Issue	153
10.3 Strict Liability and Shared Responsibility: Addressing Intent and Aiding Assistance, Swarms and Allocation of Responsibility, and Programming and Authority Issues	153
10.3.1 Strict Liability and Intent and Aiding Assistance Issue	153
10.3.2 Strict Liability and Swarms and Allocation of Responsibility Issue	154
10.3.3 Strict Liability and Programming and Authority Issue	154
10.4 Damage as a Trade-off for Strict Liability: Addressing Damage and Ascertaining the Wrongful Act Issue and <i>Tempus Comissi Delicti</i> Issue	155
10.4.1 Damage as a Trade-off for Strict Liability: Damage and Ascertaining the Wrongful Act Issue	155
10.4.2 Damage as a Tradeoff for Strict Liability: <i>Tempus Comissi Delicti</i> Issue	156
11. Issues that can be Addressed Through Other Autonomous Weapons Systems Specific Rules	157
11.1 Inapplicability of <i>Force Majeure</i> Solely Based on the Inherent Unpredictability of AWS: <i>Force Majeure</i> Issue	157
11.2 Addressing Assurance of Non-repetition Issue	158
11.3 Addressing State Responsibility for not Using AWS Issue	158
11.4 Addressing the Weapons Review Issue	159
11.5 Time Frame Limitation and Human-Machine Interaction: Addressing (part of) <i>Tempus Comissi Delicti</i> , Weapon Review, and Human-Machine Interaction Issues	161
11.6 Addressing the Human-Machine Interaction Issue	162
11.6.1 The Human-Machine Interaction Issue: Ontological Model	163
11.6.2 Human-Machine Interaction Issue and Explainable AI	165
11.7 Addressing the Due Diligence Issue	166
Conclusion	169

Appendix A: AWS Timeline	173
Appendix B: Excerpts from the Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions on AWS	175
Appendix C: Excerpts from the Final Document of the Fifth Review Conference – Decision to Formally Establish the CCW GGE	177
Appendix D: Excerpts from the Report of the 2017 Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS)	178
Appendix E: Excerpts from the Report of the 2018 Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS)	180
Appendix F: Excerpts from the Report of the 2019 Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS)	182
Appendix G: AWS Guiding Principles (CCW/MSP/2019/9)	184
Appendix H: Excerpts of the Chairperson’s Summary of the 2020 Work of the GGE – Impact of the Global Covid-19 Pandemic	186
Appendix I: Excerpts of the Report of the 2021 Session of the GGE – Statement on State Responsibility	188
Appendix J: Excerpts of the 2021 Sixth Review Conference of the High Contracting Parties to the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects	190
Appendix K: Excerpts of the Report of the 2022 Session of the GGE – Statement on State Responsibility and Comparative Table (Chair’s Draft Final Report x Report)	192
Appendix L: Excerpts of the Report of the 2023 Session of the GGE – Statement on State Responsibility	198
Appendix M: Use of AWS in Libya	200
Appendix N: Comments on the 2023 U.S. 2023 DoD Directive 30009 on Autonomy in Weapon Systems	202
Bibliography	205
Index	231